

# Separability and Entanglement of Identical Bosonic Systems

Xiao-Hong Wang<sup>1</sup>, Shao-Ming Fei<sup>1, 2</sup> and Ke Wu<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> *Department of Mathematics, Capital Normal University, Beijing, China*

<sup>2</sup> *Max-Planck-Institute for Mathematics in the Sciences, 04103 Leipzig, Germany*

**Abstract** We investigate the separability of arbitrary  $n$ -dimensional multipartite identical bosonic systems. An explicit relation between the dimension and the separability is presented. In particular, for  $n = 3$ , it is shown that the property of PPT (positive partial transpose) and the separability are equivalent for tripartite systems.

Key words: Separability, Quantum entanglement, PPT state

PACS number(s): 03.67.Hk, 03.65.Ta, 89.70.+c

Quantum entanglement plays essential roles in quantum information processing and quantum computation. The entangled states provide key resources for a vast variety of novel phenomena such as quantum cryptography, quantum teleportation, super dense coding, etc [1]. An important problem in the theory of quantum entanglement is the separability. One of the famous separability criterion was given by Peres [2]. It says that all separable states necessarily have a positive partial transpose (PPT), which is further shown to be also sufficient for states on  $\mathbb{C}^2 \otimes \mathbb{C}^2$  and  $\mathbb{C}^2 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3$  [3, 4], where  $\mathbb{C}^n$  denotes the  $n$ -dimensional complex space. There have been many results on the separability and entanglements of mixed states, see e.g., [5, 6, 7, 8, 9]. In particular, it is shown that every quantum states  $\rho$  supported on  $\mathbb{C}^M \otimes \mathbb{C}^N$ ,  $\mathbb{C}^2 \otimes \mathbb{C}^2 \otimes \mathbb{C}^N$  and  $\mathbb{C}^2 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^N$  with positive partial transposes and rank  $r(\rho) \leq N$  are separable and have a canonical form [5, 6, 7].

Although the entanglement is extensively studied for distinguishable particle systems, the entanglement of identical particle systems has been less investigated. In fact in certain systems such as quantum dots [10], Bose-Einstein condensates [11] and parametric down conversion [12], the entanglement should be treated as the one of identical particle systems. Schliemann et al [10, 13] have discussed the entanglement in two-fermion systems. They found that the entanglement in two-fermion systems is analogous to that in a two-distinguishable particle system. The results for two-boson systems are quite different. Li *et al.* [14] and Paskauskas and You [15] have studied this problem of two-boson systems. For multipartite bosonic systems, there are very few discussions. Recently, the author in [16] obtained the canonical form for pure states of three identical bosons, and classified the

entanglement correlation into two types, the analogous GHZ and the W-types. In [17], it has been shown that rank  $n$  and rank  $\frac{n(n+1)}{2} - 2$  PPT bosonic mixed states in the symmetrized tensor product space  $\mathcal{S}(\mathbb{C}^n \otimes \mathbb{C}^n)$  are separable, and all three-qubit ( $n = 2$ ) bosonic PPT states are separable as well. For bosonic mixed state  $\rho$  in  $k$ -qubit system,  $k \geq 4$ ,  $\rho$  is PPT implies that  $\rho$  is separable, except for the case of maximal rank.

In this letter, we investigate the separability of multi-partite identical bosonic systems with arbitrary dimension  $n$ . Let  $\mathcal{H} = \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{C}^n \otimes \mathbb{C}^n \otimes \cdots \otimes \mathbb{C}^n)$  denote the symmetrized tensor product space of  $k$   $n$ -dimensional spaces associated with Alice, Bob, Charle, etc. The dimension of the space  $\mathcal{H}$  is given by [18],

$$I_n^k = \frac{(n+k-1)!}{k!(n-1)!} = C_{n+k-1}^k. \quad (1)$$

We first consider the case of  $k = 3$ .

**[Theorem 1]** Let  $\rho$  be a bosonic mixed state in  $\mathcal{S}(\mathbb{C}^n \otimes \mathbb{C}^n \otimes \mathbb{C}^n)$ , with a positive partial transpose with respect to Alice. If the rank of  $\rho$ ,  $r(\rho) \leq n^2$ , then  $\rho$  is separable.

**Proof.** We first prove the case of  $n = 3$ . Suppose that the state  $\rho$  is a PPT state with respect to Alice and has a rank 9. We can treat it as a bipartite PPT state in a  $3 \times 9$  dimensional space of Alice-(Bob,Charlie). From the Theorem 1 in [5] ( also Theorem 1 in [6]), such a state of rank 9 is necessarily separable and can be represented as  $\rho = \sum_{i=1}^9 p_i |e_i, \Psi_i\rangle \langle e_i, \Psi_i|$ , where the vectors  $|\Psi_i\rangle$  are generally entangled pure states associated with the spaces of Bob and Charlie. As  $|\Psi_i\rangle$  are mutually orthogonal, they belong to the range of the reduced density matrix (partial trace with respect to the space associated with Alice)  $\text{Tr}_A \rho$ , and hence  $|\Psi_i\rangle \in \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3)$ . Moreover  $|e_i, \Psi_i\rangle$  belong to the range of  $\rho$ . Therefore  $|e_i, \Psi_i\rangle \in \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3)$ . According to Schmidt decomposition we can write  $|\Psi_i\rangle = a_i|00\rangle + b_i|11\rangle + c_i|22\rangle$  for some  $a_i, b_i, c_i \in \mathbb{C}$ , where  $|0\rangle, |1\rangle, |2\rangle$ , are the Schmidt basic vectors in  $\mathbb{C}^3$ . The only possible forms of  $|e_i, \Psi_i\rangle$  satisfying the above conditions are  $|000\rangle, |111\rangle$  or  $|222\rangle$ . Therefore  $\rho$  is separable.

When the rank of  $\rho$  is strictly less than 9,  $\rho$  can be embedded into a smaller space. For instance, if  $r(\rho) = 8$ ,  $\rho$  is supported on spaces  $2 \times 8$  or  $3 \times 8$ .  $\rho$  is then separable in the partition Alice-(Bob,Charlie) and can be again written as  $\rho = \sum_{i=1}^8 p_i |e_i, \Psi_i\rangle \langle e_i, \Psi_i|$ . By using the same procedure as above, we can prove that  $|e_i, \Psi_i\rangle$  is fully separable, and hence  $\rho$  is separable. The general  $n$ -dimensional case can be proved similarly.  $\square$

**[Remark ]** From the theorem we see that a bosonic mixed state  $\rho$  in  $\mathcal{S}(\mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3)$  with a positive partial transpose is separable if  $r(\rho) \leq 9$ . As the dimension of the space of  $\mathcal{S}(\mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3)$  is 10, Theorem 1 says that almost all the PPT bosonic mixed states in  $\mathcal{S}(\mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3)$  are separable, except for the case  $r(\rho) = 10$ . Hence the rank of a bound entangled state in  $\mathcal{S}(\mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3)$  has to be 10.

When  $n = 4$ , we have  $I_4^3 = 20$ . As  $\rho$  is separable if  $r(\rho) \leq 16$ , all bound entangled states  $\rho$  in  $\mathcal{S}(\mathbb{C}^n \otimes \mathbb{C}^n \otimes \mathbb{C}^n)$  satisfy  $17 \leq r(\rho) \leq 20$ .

**[Theorem 2]** Let  $\rho$  be a PPT bosonic mixed state in  $\mathcal{S}(\mathbb{C}^n \otimes \mathbb{C}^n \otimes \cdots \otimes \mathbb{C}^n)$  with  $k$  subsystems ( $k \geq 4$ ). If  $r(\rho) \leq I_n^{k-1}$ , then  $\rho$  is separable.

**Proof.** We prove the case of  $n = 3$  (the other cases can be proved similarly). Assume that  $\rho$  is PPT, say with respect to the space associated with Alice, with rank  $I_3^{k-1} = \frac{k(k+1)}{2}$ .

If we consider  $\rho$  as a bipartite state in the partition Alice - the rest,  $\rho$  is supported on  $\mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathcal{S}((\mathbb{C}^3)^{\otimes k-1})$ . From [5]  $\rho$  is separable with respect to this partition and has a form,  $\rho = \sum_{i=1}^{\frac{k(k+1)}{2}} p_i |e_i, \Psi_i\rangle \langle e_i, \Psi_i|$ , where  $|e_i\rangle$  (resp.  $|\Psi_i\rangle$ ) are vectors on the spaces associated to Alice (resp. the rest).

We prove result by induction. We illustrate the procedure by proving the case of  $k = 4$ . As  $|\Psi_i\rangle$  belong to the range of the reduced density matrix  $\text{Tr}_A \rho$ , they must belong to  $\mathcal{S}(\mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3)$ . Since  $\rho$  is PPT  $|\Psi_i\rangle \langle \Psi_i|$  is a PPT state in  $\mathcal{S}(\mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3)$ . However the rank  $r(|\Psi_i\rangle \langle \Psi_i|) = 1$ , from Theorem 1,  $|\Psi_i\rangle$  is separable, and can be written as  $|\Psi_i\rangle = |f_i, f_i, f_i\rangle$  for some vectors  $|f_i\rangle$  in  $\mathbb{C}^3$ . While the vectors  $|e_i, \Psi_i\rangle$  belong to the range of  $\rho$  and hence  $|e_i, \Psi_i\rangle \in \mathcal{S}(\mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3 \otimes \mathbb{C}^3)$ . Therefore the only possible forms of  $|e_i, \Psi_i\rangle$  are  $|f_i, f_i, f_i, f_i\rangle$ . Therefore  $\rho$  is separable.  $\square$

We have presented some separability criteria for multipartite bosonic mixed states. For tripartite PPT states, all bound entangled states have necessarily rank greater than  $n^2$ . For general multipartite PPT bosonic states with  $k$  subsystems ( $k \geq 4$ ), if  $r(\rho) \leq I_n^{k-1}$ ,  $\rho$  is separable. The results can be used to construct possible bound entangled states of identical bosonic systems. For instance, if  $k = 4$ ,  $n = 3$ , we have  $I_3^4 = 15$ . The rank of a bound entangled state has to be between  $I_3^3 = 10$  and 15.

## References

- [1] M.A. Nielsen and I.L. Chuang, Quantum Computation and Quantum Information, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2000.
- [2] A. Peres, Phys. Rev. Lett. **77**, 1413 (1996).
- [3] M. Horodecki, P. Horodecki and R. Horodecki, Phys. Lett. A **223**, 1 (1996).
- [4] P. Horodecki, Phys. Lett. A **232**, 333 (1997).
- [5] P. Horodecki, M. Lewenstein, G. Vidal and I. Cirac, Phys. Rev. A **62**, 032310 (2000).
- [6] S. Karnas and M. Lewenstein, Phys. Rev. A **64**, 042313 (2001).
- [7] S. M. Fei, X. H. Gao, X. H. Wang, Z. X. Wang and K. Wu, Phys. Rev. A **68**, 022315(2003).

- [8] S. Albeverio, S.M. Fei and D. Goswami, Phys. Lett. A 286, 91(2001).  
S. Albeverio and S. M. Fei , J. Opt. B: Quantum Semiclass.Opt. 3, 223(2001).  
S.M. Fei, X.H. Gao, X.H. Wang, Z.X. Wang and K. Wu, Phys. Lett. A **300**, 559 (2002).  
S.M. Fei, X.H. Gao, X.H. Wang, Z.X. Wang and K. Wu, Int. J. Quant. Inform. **1**, 37 (2003) .
- [9] K. Chen, S. Albeverio and S.M. Fei, Phys. Rev. Lett. **95**, 040504 (2005);
- [10] J. Schliemann, D. Loss, and A. H. MacDonald, Phys. Rev. B **63**, 085311 (2001).
- [11] A. Sørensen, L.M. Duan, J.I. Cirac and P. Zoller, Nature **409** (2001) 63.
- [12] Y.H. Kim, M.V. Chekhova, S.P. Kulik, M.H. Rubin and Y. Shih, Phys. Rev. A. **63**, 062301 (2001).
- [13] J. Schliemann, J. I. Cirac, M. Kuś, M. Lewenstein, and D. Loss, Phys. Rev. A **64**, 022303 (2001).
- [14] Y. S. Li, B. Zeng, X. S. Liu, and G. L. Long, Phys. Rev. A **64**, 054302 (2001).
- [15] R. Paskauskas and L. You, Phys. Rev. A **64**, 042310 (2001).
- [16] B. Zeng, D. L. Zhou, Z. Xu, and L. You, Phys. Rev. A **71**, 042317 (2005).
- [17] K. Eckert, J. Schliemann, D. Bruß and M. Lewenstein, Annals of Physics **299**, 88 (2002).
- [18] M. Hamermesh, "Group theory and its application to physical problems", Addison-Wesley Publishing Company, Reading, Massachusetts, USA,1962.